

**PROPOSAL EVALUATION SUMMARY:**

<b>Offerors</b>	<b>Evaluation Results (1,000 points possible)</b>
Jack's Tire & Oil Management Co., Inc. dba Jack's Tire & Oil – Phoenix, AZ	922 points
Redburn Tire Company – Phoenix, AZ	908 points
Purcell Tire Company – Phoenix, AZ	812 points
Roberts Tire Sales, Inc. – Mesa, AZ	774 points
GCR Tire Center – Phoenix, AZ	Non-Responsive (Incomplete submittal)
Wingfoot Commercial Tire Systems, LLC – Phoenix, AZ	Non-Responsive (Incomplete submittal)
Tire Centers, LLC – Phoenix, AZ	Facility located out of state. Team could not travel to conduct site visit.

**Comments:**

Only Purcell, Jack's and Roberts provided all the requested information in their proposal. It was also determined the RFP did not call out the separate widths on the main tire being used so requests were submitted to all vendors for additional information. Wingfoot and GCR were excluded from the evaluation/scoring as their proposals were incomplete and deemed Non-Responsive. All other vendors were invited to host site visits for the evaluation team. As Tire Center's facility was out of state, the team could not travel to conduct a site visit.

The team conducted site visits to evaluate the remaining four proposals (Jack's, Redburn, Purcell and Roberts). Three of the proposals closely followed the manufacturers prescribed methods with the exception of Roberts who are certified by two manufacturers but their retreading controls were not as rigid as the others. Jack's use of their manufacturer processes was clearly above the others throughout the whole manufacturing process including independent factory certification and annual testing for their staff. Jack's plant was also significantly cleaner with no accumulations of dust or debris visible. The top three also used computerized manufacturing controls and tracking of casings which provides superior controls.

While scoring was close, the team felt Jack's could provide the best overall product to the City of Mesa.

**CITY OF MESA  
AWARD RECOMMENDATION  
TIRE RECAPPING SERVICES  
(REQUEST FOR PROPOSAL #2011200)**

**Jack's Tire & Oil Management Co., Inc. dba Jack's Tire & Oil  
Phoenix, AZ**

<b>Description</b>	<b>Annual Contract Amount</b>
Tire Recapping Services per specifications	<b>\$425,000</b>